Designing the Module Structure

Designing a module structure (OOD)
Address Book exercise

Elements of Architectural Design

- Design goals
  - What are we trying to accomplish in the decomposition?
- Relevant Structure
  - How do we capture and communicate design decisions?
  - What are the components, relations, interfaces?
- Decomposition principles
  - How do we distinguish good design decisions?
  - What decomposition (design) principles support the objectives?
- Evaluation criteria
  - How do I tell a good design from a bad one?
Architecture Design Process

Building architecture to address business goals:
1. Understand the goals for the system
2. Define the quality requirements
3. Design the architecture
   1. Views: which architectural structures should we use? (goals<->architectural structures<->representation)
   2. Documentation: how do we communicate design decisions?
   3. Design: how do we decompose the system?
4. Evaluate the architecture (is it a good design?)

Examples of Key Architectural Structures

• Module Structure
  – Decomposition of the system into work assignments (called modules)
  – Most influential design time structure
    • Modifiability, work assignments, concurrent development, maintainability, reusability, understandability, etc.

• Uses Structure
  – Determine which modules may use one another’s services
  – Determines subsetability, ease of integration
Modularization

• For any large, complex system, must divide the coding into work assignments (WBS)
• Each work assignment is called a “module”
• Properties of a “good” module structure
  – Parts can be designed independently
  – Parts can be tested independently
  – Parts can be changed independently
  – Integration goes smoothly

What is a module?

• Concept due to David Parnas (conceptual basis for objects)
• A module is characterized by two things:
  – Its interface: services that the module provides to other parts of the systems
  – Its secrets: what the module hides (encapsulates). Design/implementation decisions that other parts of the system should not depend on
• Modules are abstract, design-time entities
  – Modules are “black boxes” – specifies the visible properties but not the implementation
  – May, or may not, directly correspond to programming components like classes/objects
    • E.g., one module may be implemented by several objects
Notional Modules

Designing the Module Structure

How do we design to arrive at the desired qualities?
Decomposition Strategies Differ

• How do we develop this structure so that the leaf modules make independent work assignments?
• Many ways to decompose hierarchically
  – Functional: each module is a function
  – Pipes and Filters: each module is a step in a chain of processing
  – Transactional: data transforming components
  – OOD: use case driven development
• These result in different kinds of dependencies

Use Case Driven OO Process

• Address book design: in-class exercise
• Requirements
• Problem Analysis
  – Identify use cases from requirements
  – Identify domain classes operationalizing use cases (apply heuristics)
• OO Design (refinement)
  – Allocate responsibilities among classes
  – Identify object interactions supporting use cases
  – Identify supporting classes (& associations)
• Detailed Design
  – Design class interfaces (class attributes and services)
Decomposition Heuristics

• Heuristics: suppose we create objects by …
  – Underline the nouns
  – Identify causal agents
  – Identify coherent services
  – Identify real-world items
  – Identify physical devices
  – Identify essential abstractions
  – Identify transactions
  – Identify persistent information
  – Identify visual elements
  – Identify control elements
  – Execute scenarios

Address Book

• Is this a good design?
  – Based on the handout provided
  – Justify your answer: what is good about it (or bad) and why?
General OO Objectives

- Manage complexity
- Improve maintainability
- Improve stakeholder communication
- Improve productivity
- Improve reuse
- Provide unified development model (consistency)

General OO Principles

- Principles provided to support goals
- Abstraction and Problem modeling
  - Development in terms of problem domain
  - Supports communication, productivity
- Generalization/Specialization (type of abstraction)
  - Inheritance of shared attributes & Delayed Binding (polymorphism)
  - Support for reuse, productivity
- Modularization and Information Hiding
  - Supports maintainability, reuse
- Independence (abstract interfaces + IH)
  - Classes designed as independent entities
  - Supports readability, reuse, maintainability
- Common underlying model
  - OO model for analysis, design, and programming
  - Supports unified development
Modularization using Information Hiding

Set up meetings for next week
Address Book Example

Decomposition Strategies

• How do we develop this structure so that the leaf modules make independent work assignments?
• Observed strategies did not result in independent modules
  – Use-case driven OOD, heuristics
  – MVC Pattern
• What should be done differently?
  – Why did these approaches fail?
Use Case Driven OO Process

- Address book design: in-class exercise
- Requirements
- Problem Analysis
  - Identify use cases from requirements
  - Identify domain classes operationalizing use cases (apply heuristics)
- OO Design (refinement)
  - Allocate responsibilities among classes
  - Identify object interactions supporting use cases
  - Identify supporting classes (& associations)
- Detailed Design
  - Design class interfaces (class attributes and services)

Modularization Design Goals

- Goals for complex systems, not specific to the application
- Divide the coding into work assignments (modules) such that:
  - Modules can be designed independently
  - Modules can be worked on concurrently
  - Modules can be tested independently
  - Can understand or review the system one module at a time
  - Likely changes can be implemented as changes to a single or small number of modules
More Specific Design Goals

- Be easy to make the following kinds of change
  - Ability to edit the name fields while keeping the associated data
  - Ability to search the address book
  - Add additional fields to the entries: e.g. email, mobile phone, and business phone
- Support subsets and extensions
  - Produce a simpler version of the address book with only names and phone #
  - Allow user to keep multiple address books of different kinds (i.e., different fields)
  - Allow the user-defined fields

Modular Structure

- Architecture = components, relations, and interfaces
- Components
  - Called modules
  - Leaf modules are work assignments
  - Non-leaf modules are the union of their submodules
- Relations (connectors)
  - submodule-of => implements-secrets-of
    - Module is an aggregate of its submodules
  - Constrained to be acyclic tree (hierarchy)
- Interfaces (externally visible component behavior)
  - Defined in terms of access procedures (services or method)
  - Services provide only access to module internals
Module Hierarchy

Submodule-of Relation

- Decomposition Rules
  - If a module holds decisions that are likely to change independently, then decompose it into submodules
  - Don’t stop until each module contains only things likely to change together
  - Anything that other modules should not depend on become secrets of the module (e.g., implementation details)
  - If the module has an interface, only things not likely to change can be part of the interface
Decomposition Strategy

• Decompose recursively
  – If a module holds decisions that are likely to change independently, then decompose it into submodules
  – Decisions that are likely to change together are allocated to the same submodule
  – Decisions that change independently should be allocated to different submodules
• Stopping criteria
  – Each module contains only things likely to change together
  – Each module is simple enough to be understood fully, small enough that it makes sense to throw it away rather than re-do
• Define the Interfaces
  – Anything that other modules should not depend on become secrets of the module (e.g., implementation details)
  – If the module has an interface, only things not likely to change can be part of the interface

Effects of Changes

• Consider what happens to communication among module developers
• Suppose we have groups of requirements R1 – R3:
  – R1 and R3 are related and likely to change together
  – R2 is likely to change independently
• Suppose we put R1 and R2 in the same module and assign to different teams
  – What happens when R1 changes?
  – R2?
• Suppose R1 and R3 are put in the same module?
Applied Information Hiding

- The rule we just described is called the *information hiding principle*
- Design principle of limiting dependencies between components by hiding information other components should not depend on
- An information hiding decomposition is one following the design principles that:
  - System details that are likely to change independently are encapsulated in different modules
  - The interface of a module reveals only those aspects considered unlikely to change

---

Design Principles
Three Key Design Principles

- Address the basic issue: which constructs are essential to the problem solution vs. which can change
  - “Fundamental assumptions”
  - “Likely changes”
- Most solid first
- Information hiding
- Abstraction

Principle: Most Solid First

- View design as a sequence of decisions
  - Later decisions depend on earlier
  - Early decisions harder to change
- Most solid first: in a sequence of decisions, those that are least likely to change should be made first
- Goal: reduce rework by limiting the impact of changes
- Application: used to order a sequence of design decisions
  - Generally applicable to design decisions
  - Module decomposition – ease of change
  - Developing families – create most commonality
Information Hiding

- Information hiding: Design principle of limiting dependencies between components by hiding information other components should not depend on
- An information hiding decomposition is one following the design principles that (Parnas):
  - System details that are likely to change independently are encapsulated in different modules
  - The interface of a module reveals only those aspects considered unlikely to change

Abstraction

- General: disassociating from specific instances to represent what the instances have in common
  - Abstraction defines a *one-to-many relationship*  
    E.g., one type, many possible implementations
- Modular decomposition: Interface design principle of providing only essential information and suppressing unnecessary detail
Abstraction

- Two primary uses
- Reduce Complexity
  - Goal: manage complexity by reducing the amount of information that must be considered at one time
  - Approach: Separate information important to the problem at hand from that which is not
    - Abstraction suppresses or hides "irrelevant detail"
    - Examples: stacks, queues, abstract device
- Model the problem domain
  - Goal: leverage domain knowledge to simplify understanding, creating, checking designs
  - Approach: Provide components that make it easier to model a class of problems
    - May be quite general (e.g., type real, type float)
    - May be very problem specific (e.g., class automobile, book object)

Example: Simple Library Model

- What are the abstractions?
- What information is hidden?
Benefits Good Module Specs

- Enables development of complex projects:
  - Support partitioning system into separable modules
  - Complements incremental development approaches
- Improves quality of software deliverables:
  - Clearly defines what will be implemented
  - Errors are found earlier
  - Error Detection is easier
  - Improves testability
- Defines clear acceptance criteria
- Defines expected behavior of module
- Clarifies what will be easy to change, what will be hard to change
- Clearly identifies work assignments

Summary

- Heuristics and patterns are guidelines
  - Do not guarantee qualities
  - Must understand how and why they work to apply effectively
- Principles are more direct – achieve qualities by construction
- Good design requires careful thinking
  - Which goals are we trying to achieve
  - How design decisions address those goals